

Carruthers, G. (2018) Jacobite Unionism. In: Carruthers, G. and Kidd, C. (eds.) *Literature and Union: Scottish Texts, British Contexts*. Oxford University Press: Oxford. ISBN 9780198736233 (doi:[10.1093/oso/9780198736233.003.0006](https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780198736233.003.0006)).

This is the author's final accepted version.

There may be differences between this version and the published version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

<http://eprints.gla.ac.uk/141267/>

Deposited on: 19 May 2017

Enlighten – Research publications by members of the University of Glasgow  
<http://eprints.gla.ac.uk>

## *Jacobite Unionism*

Gerard Carruthers

Arguably, amidst the fierce ideological battles that raged in Scotland between the Revolution of 1689 and Reform in 1832, the Union of the nation's Parliament with its English counterpart in 1707 was almost incidental. Of more enduring concern, certainly after 1707, were religious and dynastic matters rather than any desire to restore Scotland's Parliament whose reputation for either efficiency or democracy was not necessarily great.<sup>1</sup> The oft-repeated claim that Scotland remained more or less as culturally distinctive after 1707 cites the institutions of Church, Law and Universities as the important capsules of Scottish identity. As regards the first of these, the ructions that recur throughout the eighteenth-century and beyond are rooted specifically in the Church Patronage Act (Scotland) of 1711-12, which essentially allowed the landed classes to obtain control over ministerial appointments in the parishes, and superseded the previous rights - since 1690 - of appointment by church congregations. Certainly, it should be mentioned that opponents of the act repeatedly denounced it as contrary to the Union of 1707 since its passage had been accompanied by measures which guaranteed a separate sphere of Scottish church governance.<sup>2</sup> The Union also provided for a largely autonomous legal system in Scotland, at

---

<sup>1</sup> Although see recent revisionist work here; for instance, K. Brown & A.J. Mann (eds), *The History of the Scottish Parliament II: Parliament and Politics in Scotland, 1567-1707* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004).

<sup>2</sup> See Andrew Herron, *Kirk by Divine Right, Church and State: Peaceful Co-existence* (Edinburgh: St Andrew Press, 1985) for a brilliantly clear summation of the very complex history surrounding eighteenth-century patronage disputes.

the core of which was the Faculty of Advocates in Edinburgh. A significant shift can be discerned in the change of Keeper (or principal librarian) at the Advocates from Thomas Ruddiman (1674-1757) to David Hume (1711-76) in 1752, a transition that exemplifies the diminution of Jacobite cultural power at the heart of the Scottish legal establishment, six years after the failure of the last Jacobite Rebellion of 1745-46.<sup>3</sup> Such changes in ideological complexion also enabled a smoother collaboration between the Faculty of Advocates and the Scottish universities in the broad project of the Scottish Enlightenment. These universities, thirled to civic and Kirk authorities, however, were the keepers of an educational legacy that was far from uncontested. Proponents of the Moderate Party (resigned to the fact of Patronage and liberal in theology) and the Popular Party (decidedly anti-Patronage and more conservative in religion) vied for control of the universities, certainly at Edinburgh and Glasgow well into the nineteenth century.<sup>4</sup> Throughout the eighteenth century this internal fault-line in the established church - a mainstay of Scottish culture - coexisted with other elements of disorder. Indeed, both Jacobitism and later Jacobinism were highly combustible. Moreover, the Covenanting zeal represented by the Popular Party in church and university and outside the establishment by varieties of Seceding churches and smaller Covenanting sects,<sup>5</sup> makes eighteenth-century Scotland look more like a nation on perpetual 'revolutionary' alert than in a state of settled enlightenment.

---

<sup>3</sup> For an important account of Ruddiman's career, integral in the Scots literary 'revival' of the early eighteenth-century, see Douglas Duncan, *Thomas Ruddiman: A Study in Scottish Scholarship of the Early Eighteenth Century* (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1965).

<sup>4</sup> Crucial to an understanding of the internal politics of the Scottish universities in the period is Roger L. Emerson, *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh and St Andrews Universities* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008).

<sup>5</sup> Colin Kidd, 'Conditional Britons: the Scots Covenanting Tradition and the eighteenth-century British State', *English Historical Review* 117 (2002), 1147-76.

Issues of kingship and religion constituted the dominant themes in Scottish literature between 1689 and 1832. Both Jacobitism and the Whig-Presbyterian heritage provided the diet on which creative writers fed. Walter Scott's *Waverley* (1814) centred on the 1745 rebellion, while his *The Tale of Old Mortality* (1816) focussed on the late seventeenth-century Covenanters. These texts represent the twin pulses of the Scottish literary imagination for the best part of two centuries after 1688. Where was the novel about 1707 through the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries? The answer might be that it did not occur to Scots that the surrender of their indigenous parliament impacted so particularly upon their identity as did wider - and deeper - confessional and dynastic issues or the partisan contexts in which they were mired. This came most sharply into focus with Scott's *Old Mortality*, which provoked strong reactions from his contemporaries James Hogg (1770-1835) who produced *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* in 1818 and John Galt (1779-1839), whose *Ringan Gilhaize* was published in 1823. Both Hogg and Galt created a whole series of fiction that reflected centrally on Scotland's Presbyterian identity. Indeed, Hogg's *Private Memoirs and Confessions of A Justified Sinner* (1824) - a further contribution to the debate inaugurated by *Old Mortality*<sup>6</sup> - is now seen as a classic of the romantic period, with its deep psychological portrayal of fanaticism. Indeed, André Gide's revival of the tale in 1947 as a post-Holocaust novel demonstrates the portability of its concerns, a move which diverges from a marked line of culturally nationalist Scottish criticism that saw early nineteenth-century Scottish fiction's concern with religion as a (mass-psychological) displacement of what ought to have been authors' proper concerns with the 'secular' state after 1707.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> Douglas Mack, 'The Rage of Fanaticism in former days: James Hogg's *Confessions* and the controversy over *Old Mortality*', in Ian Campbell (ed.), *Nineteenth-century Scottish Fiction* (Manchester: Carcanet, 1979).

<sup>7</sup> David Craig, for instance, sees the nineteenth-century Scottish novel of religion authorially-engaged and of 'the people', yet his overarching secularism also sees it in the context of 'backward ideas of the past', not

Like religion, the concern with dynasty in Scottish literature and song (these two things sharing an often symbiotic relationship) has been read by many critics as a rather anachronistic cultural formation. However, this was part of a long, interlinked and enduring ideological battle going back at least as far as the British Civil Wars of 1639-51, with loyalty to the Stuart cause most often a counterpoint to the Whig, Presbyterian or Calvinist interest. Although frequently invoked by twentieth-century commentators as a reaction to 1707, the *Choice Collection of Comic and Serious Scots Poems* (1706, 1709 and 1711) edited by James Watson (d.1722) was the work of a Catholic Jacobite whose pro-Stuart allegiance, rather than his anti-unionism *per se*, was here, in fact, writ large. The sensibility espoused in this series of anthologies published in the Scottish capital was in opposition to the puritanical city fathers of Edinburgh, seen as representatives too of a wider Calvinist Scotland and as existing within another, related 'uncultured' context, the rampant commercialism as read by many Tories, symptomatic of the reign of Queen Anne. Early eighteenth-century Edinburgh saw men like Watson, Episcopalian, Thomas Ruddiman and the nominally-Presbyterian Allan Ramsay (1684-1758) congregating around the intellectual leadership of Archibald Pitcairne (1652-1713).<sup>8</sup> Pitcairne satirised the hypocritical, covetous Calvinists of Scotland in his play, *The Assembly* (1691), which mocked the General Assembly of Scotland and reprised the spirit of David Lindsay's satire on the medieval church in *Satire of the Three Estates* (c.1552) (itself usually read in literary history as a crucial sign of the changing winds that were bringing the Reformation). Indeed, here in Pitcairne's text, *The*

---

representing 'the whole life of the people' and even as 'pre-political', David Craig, *Scottish Literature and the Scottish People 1680-1830* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1961), p.197.

<sup>8</sup> Crucial in the understanding of this relationship is F.W. Freeman & A. Law, 'Allan Ramsay's First Published Poem: The Poem to the Memory of Archibald Pitcairne' in *Bibliotheca* 9 (1979), pp.153-60; see also Murray G.H. Pittock, 'Were the Easy Club Jacobites?' in *Scottish Literary Journal* 17:1 (1990), pp.91-94.

*Assembly*, tellingly *before* the demise of Scottish parliament, was a negative tribute to the power of the Kirk Assembly as a guiding cultural force, more powerful perhaps in this respect than the secular gathering of MPs and Lords in the Scottish capital.

The rationalist, Tory-Jacobite mentality of Pitcairne and his circle encouraged the promotion of classical values in Scotland.<sup>9</sup> One product of this being Ruddiman's edition of Gavin Douglas's original 1513 translation of Virgil in the *Eneados* (1710). Importantly, the Scots glossary in this edition was an inspiration to Ramsay's attempted eighteenth-century revival of an older Scots poetry. Ramsay, like Pitcairne and Ruddiman, was a Jacobite who bought into the Stuart-loyal ideological position generally that Scotland needed a cultural revival in the face of the crass, enervating Whig domination of the country. This accounts for Ramsay's multitudinous activities as editor of poetry, in English as well as Scots, his promotion of music, theatre and art.<sup>10</sup> It was Scots poetry that was to be Ramsay's enduring legacy through the eighteenth century and which represents an essential root in the Jacobitism of Robert Burns (1759-96). This was modal as well as thematically explicit, Ramsay's usage of the 'standard Habbie' stanza, being taken from Watson's publication of 'The Life and Death of the Piper of Kilbarchan, Habbie Simpson.' Later, Burns' use of the stanza would find it re-Christened the 'Burns stanza'. 'Habbie Simson' was dubiously attributed by James Watson to Robert Sempill of Beltrees (c.1505-76), staunch Catholic and supporter of Mary, Queen of Scots. Here is one stanza describing the kind of service that Habbie the bagpiper had provided:

---

<sup>9</sup> Colin Kidd, 'The Ideological Significance of Scottish Jacobite Latinity', in Jeremy Black and Jeremy Gregory (eds.), *Culture, Politics and Society in Britain 1660-1800* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991).

<sup>10</sup> For modern accounts of Ramsay in his ideology and in his varied cultural activities, see Murray Pittock, Chapter 2: 'Allan Ramsay and the Decolonization of Genre' in his *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) and the same author's entry in the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004).

So kindly to his Neighbour neist,  
At Beltan and Saint Barchans Feast.  
He blew and then held up his Breast,  
as he were weid, [possessed  
But now we need not him arest?  
For Habbie's dead.<sup>11</sup>

We glimpse, then, the 'Catholic' calendar of festivity, with which Habbie assisted, rendered in a stanza-form (going back in origins probably to the troubadours of France) that in its jaunty arrangement of iambic tetrameter and trimeter conveyed the idea of joy that the Jacobite interest claimed was being lost in Calvinist Scotland (the lament for Habbie being metonymic of a nation's lament).

The other stanza-form that Burns imbibed via Watson and Ramsay was the 'Christ's Kirk' stanza-form from the medieval poem, 'Christ's Kirk on the Green' attributed – again very dubiously – to not one but two Stuart kings, James I and James V. The important point of course was the idea of the Scottish-cradled Stuarts as men of culture, poets, and also, as 'Christ's Kirk On the Green' might be seen to exemplify, ready to involve themselves in a scene of integrated community celebration, involving the various strata of society. This myth of community, Tory-Jacobite in its outlook, including a happy hoi polloi, represents one myth of 'the people' in Scotland in competition, broadly, with the 'democratic' kirk myth of the people. Does Burns, then, derive what were to become his populist themes (and

---

<sup>11</sup> *James Watson's Collection of Comic and Serious Scots Poems* (Glasgow: M. Ogle, 1869), p.33.

indeed ultimate iconicity) from Jacobite or Presbyterian origins, or perhaps from a confection conflated from the cultural claims of both? It is interesting to note in the two main stanzas of the eighteenth-century Scots poetic renaissance, medieval and sixteenth-century revivalism, a backward-reflex re-projecting pre-Hanoverian and ultimately pre-Reformation times. Episcopalians and moderate Presbyterians such as Ramsay and Burns, as well as Catholics, could increasingly lament the puritanical form of Protestantism which had emerged in sixteenth-century Scotland. Antiquarianism can be found elsewhere in the eighteenth-century Scots poetic project, including what might be its most famous text, 'Auld Lang Syne'. Allan Ramsay produces his own version of this old song in 1720, beginning, 'Should auld acquaintance be forgot,/Tho' they return with scars?'<sup>12</sup> In other words part of the setting for Ramsay's version is returning comrades (presumably having fought together in the pro-Stuart cause). Burns loses such ideological resonance altogether in his version of 1788, producing instead a song appropriate to a new age of immigration and international travel. This is typical of the transitional creative effect that Burns often operates, so that today Scotland is largely oblivious of the song's ideological lineage (as well as of the Scots Poetry revival of the eighteenth-century, generally). Here, literary history shows us the elision of a particular ideology but also suggests an ongoing though transformed political significance (in which Burns - unconsciously - conspired). The result is that poetry in Scots, most especially in the twentieth-century, comes to be associated with Scottish 'Nationalism', generally, and in a secularised, non-dynastic version which would be somewhat alien to Ramsay and Burns (notwithstanding the fact that as we have seen the latter helps effect this transition).

---

<sup>12</sup> *The Works of Allan Ramsay I*, ed. Burns Martin and John W. Oliver (Edinburgh: Scottish Text Society, 1944), p.45.



What, then, of Burns' explicit Jacobitism? Where does this come from, after the event, as it were, after 1745? One of the things we need to understand as background to the literary expression of Jacobitism and its longevity is the co-relative anti-Jacobite rhetoric of eighteenth-century Britain, persisting even as the threat of the Stuarts returning had receded. One example here is instructive. It is to be found in a poem by Charles Churchill (1732-64), 'The Prophecy of Famine' which very quickly went through large sales and four editions in London in 1763. At this time Great Britain had its first Scottish premier in John Stuart (1713-92), third Earl of Bute who is ironically attacked in Churchill's text:

What mighty blessings doth not ENGLAND owe,  
What waggon-loads of courage, wit, and sense  
Doth each revolving day import from thence?  
To us she gives, disinterested friend,  
Faith without fraud and STUARTS without end.<sup>13</sup>

No matter that this Stuart was a stalwart favourite of George III and had been hostile to Jacobitism, his name was used in cheap propaganda to imply the ongoing disloyalty of the Scots, who are also, in general in Churchill's text, intent on plundering their southern neighbour. Here we have the prototype grumbling, seen much later in connection with Tony Blair and then with Gordon Brown, that the Scots are unfairly taking the top political posts in London. Perhaps even more revealing than Churchill's text is the published frontispiece illustration. Here, a ragged (Jacobite) highlander is portrayed, the plaid barely covering his modesty, his want shown also in his extreme skinniness, and his state of cleanliness

---

<sup>13</sup> Charles Churchill, *The Prophecy of Famine* (London, 1763), p.6.

indicated in the insects that are attracted to him. Completing the scene are scant livestock, one unhealthy-looking sheep sniffing another one's bottom. The Scottish land, clearly, has nothing good to offer, except, that there is a trace-outline of some mountains coming into view, not to be denied but not yet to be sharply drawn in the detail of their sublime grandeur. The text and its illustration, of course, were exactly contemporaneous with the Ossianic moment when supposed ancient Gaelic poetry translated into English by James Macpherson (1736-96) represents a formative moment in the romantic reevaluation of Scotland: England has its green and pleasant land, but Scotland has other natural and cultural resources which might at least be consumed aesthetically. In the illustration to 'The Prophecy of Famine' we see a remarkable instance of this emerging cultural debate.

Churchill was a camp follower of John Wilkes (1725-97) who had founded the *North Briton* a year earlier, the London newspaper that specialised in mocking the Scottish influence on government. Wilkes' paper was a riposte to the periodical, *The Briton*, edited by Tobias Smollett (1721-71) and Smollett was to respond most extensively to what had become the virulent anti-Scottish culture of 1760s Britain in his novel, *The Expedition of Humphry Clinker* (1771). The text repeatedly riffs on the supposed scarcity of resource in Scotland with Smollett pointing out, with great equanimity, economic losses as well as gains in Scotland precipitated by the union of Scotland and England in the eighteenth century. It proposes something that looks like fish farming for the Highlands and that the Highlanders might well become excellent fighting units in the service of a united British army (as they were already being marshalled by the time Smollett's text appeared anyway).<sup>14</sup> Smollett also has one of his characters assured that where there are sheep's heads (the character Tabitha Bramble

---

<sup>14</sup> See Tobias Smollett, *The Expedition of Humphry Clinker* edited by Lewis M. Knapp; revised by Paul-Gabriel Boucé (Oxford & New York: Oxford World Classics, 1984), p.256; pp.253-55.

fears this will be her chief ration on reaching Scotland with her touring party) there are also sheep's bodies.<sup>15</sup> Smollett's novel is in a sense the great Unionist text of Scottish literature, countering prejudice, embracing the term 'North Briton' as a positive identity, pointing out too the prodigiously enlightened parts of Scottish culture (famously coining the 'hot-bed of genius' for what would later, in the twentieth century, become termed the Scottish Enlightenment) and also the attractions, especially the sophisticated aesthetic worth of the primitive highland landscape, as well as its undeniable disadvantages. Scotland - and especially the post-45 Highlands - is not to be sneered at, but to be recuperated and reappraised.<sup>16</sup>

This positive cultural turn towards the Highlands, generally, seen in a Unionist Scot partly explains why Burns might be enabled to write positively about Jacobitism by the time he is writing in the 1780s. However, it does not fully comprehend a facet of the Lowland, Presbyterian poet that goes well beyond the rather trite label of 'sentimental Jacobitism'. Burns's first text where his Jacobite bite becomes apparent is scratched into a window in an inn at Stirling in August 1787:

Here Stewarts once in triumph reign'd,  
And laws for Scotland's weal ordain'd;  
But now unroof'd their Palace stands,  
Their sceptre's fall'n to other hands;  
Fallen indeed, and to the earth,

---

<sup>15</sup> *Humphry Clinker*, p.220.

<sup>16</sup> *Humphry Clinker*, p.233; see Robert Crawford in *Devolving English Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992), pp.55-75, for a highly illuminating reading of *Humphry Clinker* as a novel about prejudice.

Whence grovelling reptiles take their birth.—

The injur'd STEWART-line are gone,

A Race outlandish fill their throne;

An idiot race, to honor lost;

Who know them best despise them most.<sup>17</sup>

These lines were written by Burns 'on seeing the Royal Palace [of Stirling] in ruins' during his travels through Stirlingshire following his first flush of fame as a poet. In that county, Burns was also according to later legend 'knighted', either humorously or more likely seriously, by an elderly Jacobite lady.<sup>18</sup> The lines on the window were seemingly answered by a Presbyterian clergyman whose responding couplet on the same window called Burns an 'ass's heel', with Burns supposedly smashing the window two months later in an attempt to obliterate the controversy.<sup>19</sup> Shortly afterwards, however, in December 1787, Burns was writing yet again about the Stuarts, specifically about the Young Pretender, and if anything with even more passion than before, in a text occasioned by Charles Edward's birthday, 'A Birth-day Ode. December 31<sup>st</sup> 1787', in which our Lowland, west of Scotland poet cradled in Presbyterianism celebrates John Graham of Claverhouse (c.1649-89), or 'Bloody Clavers' in Covenanting folk-memory. Indeed, in a reversal of a long-standing motif of the Covenanters being relentlessly hunted down, Burns transplants this idea to the Stuarts:

Perdition, baleful child of Night,

Ride and revenge the injur'd right

---

<sup>17</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol I ed. James Kinsley (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968), p.348.

<sup>18</sup> *The Mirror of Literature, Amusement and Instruction* (London: J. Limbird, 1832), p.411.

<sup>19</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol I, p.349.

Of St—rts' Royal Race!

Lead on th' unmuzzled hounds of Hell

Till all the frightened Echoes tell

The blood-notes of the chace!

Full on the quarry point their view,

Full on the base, usurping crew.<sup>20</sup>

Burns had begun to tune into Stuart loyalism through reading the work of historian William Tytler of Woodhouselee (1711-92), author of *The Inquiry, Historical and Critical, into the Evidence against Mary Queen of Scots, and an Examination of the Histories of Dr. Robertson and David Hume with respect to that Evidence* (Edinburgh and London 1760).<sup>21</sup> Several months before 'Here Stewarts once in triumph reign'd', Burns addressed a verse-epistle to Tytler as 'revered defender of beauteous Stuart' [i.e. Mary, Queen of Scots] and also alludes in several places in his text to his own family tradition that forebears had been out with the Jacobites in 1715. Burns writes:

Tho' something like moisture conglobes in my eye,

Let no man misdeem me disloyal;

-----

Still in pray'rs for King George I most cordially join

-----

But Politics, truce! We're on dangerous ground;

---

<sup>20</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol I, p.376.

<sup>21</sup> Tytler had also published *The Poetical Remains of James I, King of Scotland* (Edinburgh: J. and E. Balfour, 1783) exemplifying the ongoing eighteenth-century loyalty to the Stuart cause as a highly cultured one.

Who knows how the fashions may alter:  
The doctrines today that are loyalty sound,  
Tomorrow may bring us a halter.<sup>22</sup>

Notwithstanding his later, antipathetic vehemence in the lines scratched on the window and in the birthday ode for Charles Edward, Burns here expresses loyalty to the Hanoverian monarch, though exercising a certain caution (and there is caution too, as mentioned, in the Stirling window episode). We might ask why: is this because he has an eye on future prospects (Burns was soon to have employment in the Crown Excise service)? Or, is he genuinely torn between past and present, a ubiquitous human condition not unique to Scotland? The poet, clearly, was not alone in what might possibly be described as an antiquarian patriotism with a Jacobite slant. As Nigel Leask has noted, Burns also formed a close friendship in his Dumfriesshire years of the early 1790s with Robert Riddell (1755-94), sharing 'sympathies for Jacobite as well as Jacobin politics, despite the fact that his [Riddell's] father Walter had been captured by the Jacobite army in 1745'.<sup>23</sup> There were plenty of people sympathetic to Jacobitism that the poet encountered during his life-time. One of these, John Ramsay of Ochtertyre (1736-1814) was a Whig sympathetically interested in Jacobite history and who listened to similar sentiments in Burns, concluding of his attitudes that these were 'abundantly motley, he being a Jacobite, an Arminian and a Socinian'.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>22</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol I, p.332; p.333.

<sup>23</sup> Nigel Leask, *Robert Burns and Pastoral: Poetry and Improvement in Late Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), p.260.

<sup>24</sup> *Scotland and Scotsmen in the Eighteenth Century from the MSS of John Ramsay of Ochtertyre* edited by Alexander Allardyce (Edinburgh and London: W. Blackwood and Sons, 1888), p.554. It might also be mentioned too though that a powerful influence on Burns was the Episcopalian poet and song writer, John Skinner (1721-90), whose church was vandalised by the Duke of Cumberland's army following Culloden. Skinner, whom Burns met with the two expressing mutual admiration, wrote about the Jacobites, about

Ramsay's description of Burns's outlook is most often cited simply in evidence of the poet's inconsistency, or 'motley-ness', but perhaps there is here a description that points to more of a congruent synthesis than is usually thought to be the case. 'Socinian' is a term of abuse thrown at Moderate Presbyterians in this period by Popular Party adherents. It was used especially against a friend of Burns, the Reverend William McGill (1732-1807), a clergyman in Ayr who published his *Practical Essay on the Death of Jesus Christ* (1786), which resulted in a long-running action against him for heresy by more orthodox Calvinists. In seemingly downplaying the importance of the crucifixion, McGill was charged with being a 'Socinian', a term which had come to stand as a crude but effective synonym for 'Unitarian'.<sup>25</sup> Burns was deeply interested in this case from its beginnings through until 1789, when he wrote his song, 'The Kirk's Alarm' in which he defended McGill and castigated his enemies in an act that Burns himself, picking up on the anti-clericalism then working to a pitch in France, described as 'priest-skelping'.<sup>26</sup> In the same year, Burns' 'Holy Willie's Prayer' (written in 1785) was published for the only time in the poet's life-time in unauthorised chapbook form in Ayrshire, with the highly probable connivance of its author.<sup>27</sup> The coincidence of the writing of 'The Kirk's Alarm' and the 'reappearance' of 'Holy Willie's Prayer', indeed its publication in unofficial print-form run (where previously it had circulated in the much rarer form again of manuscript and in perhaps only a few copies), relates to the climax of the Popular Party activity against McGill. Burns's most 'Arminian'

---

Bannockburn and in Scots, English and Latin (including Horatian odes) exemplifying the neo-Classicism and Scots-language revivalism of the Jacobite mentality (see *John Skinner: Collected Poems* edited by David M. Bertie (Peterhead: The Buchan Field Club, 2005)).

<sup>25</sup> See *A Memorial and Remonstrance Concerning the Proceedings of the Synod of Glasgow and Ayr and of the General Assembly in the Case of Dr William McGill* (Edinburgh: n.p., 1792), p.79.

<sup>26</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol I, p.474.

<sup>27</sup> Patrick Scott, 'The First Publication of "Holy Willie's Prayer"' in *Scottish Literary Review* 7:1 (2015), pp.1-18.

text in that, for instance, it casts doubt on the doctrine of the elect and implicitly argues for the agency of free-will, 'Holy Willie's Prayer', was arguably the poem that made his career. It had been written as a piece of poetic revenge in another Popular Party versus Moderate dispute, where Burns's friend Gavin Hamilton (1751-1805) had been subject to discipline via the kirk-session of Mauchline on charges of lax church attendance and maladministration of the poor fund. Successfully defended by another friend of Burns, Robert Aiken (1739-1807) Hamilton had the case against him kicked out by the Presbytery of Ayr. 'Holy Willie's Prayer' lampooning the conservative theology and supposed hypocrisy of Hamilton's arch-enemy in the proceedings, William Auld (1709-91), was the triumph-cry of the Moderate, Ayrshire Enlightenment grouping around Hamilton. Following their delight at 'Holy Willie's Prayer', Burns was rewarded by way of Hamilton and Aiken collecting many of the subscriptions for Burns's first appearance in print in his book, *Poems, Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect* (1786). Burns clearly thought it prudent not to include his scurrilous poem in this collection, but it is likely that he encouraged its appearance in chapbook form in 1789. It was his signature anti-Popular Party text, written in the Habbie stanza and its depiction of the character of Willie owed something to Pitcairne's hypocritical, canting worldly Calvinist, Timothy Turbulent in *The Assembly*. Here Burns, the 'Arminian', the 'Socinian' too in Ramsay of Ochertyre's loose usage of the term as standing for less than scrupulously observed Calvinist tenets, forcefully uses 'Jacobite' literary technology in the service of Moderate, enlightened Ayrshire. As a kind of footnote to this ideological-cum-cultural warfare, one of McGill's chief accusers, the Reverend William Peebles (1753-1826) wrote a pamphlet attacking Burns in 1811, which included verse in English (as the appropriate mode for Presbyterian poetry as opposed to



Burns's Jacobitical Scots) which depicted him as belonging in dangerously radical company:

'A Wilkes, a Pindar, Paine and Burns.'<sup>28</sup>

If the Jacobin threat had replaced the Jacobite one by the 1790s, Burns himself shows great imaginative dexterity in melding the two discourses together, and on more than one occasion. We see this in Burns' most famous patriotic song, 'Robert Bruce's March to Bannockburn' (1793) primed by his Stuart-loyalism (Robert the Bruce might be seen as progenitor of the Stuart dynasty), ostensibly about the Wars of Independence of course, but implicitly about 'freedom', 'tyrants' and 'liberty' in the present as well as in the past.<sup>29</sup> To advance this contemporary subtext, Burns allowed his text to be published in the reform-minded London *Morning Chronicle* for 8<sup>th</sup> May, 1794, though in his letter to an intermediary with the editor of the periodical, Burns requested, 'let them insert it as a thing they have met with by accident, and unknown to me.'<sup>30</sup> Yet again, we see Burns' periodic caution about political involvement which was lifted to new codified heights in his song, 'Is there for Honest Poverty' ('A Man's a Man') written in 1795. For a start, the refrain 'for a' that' was part of a tune that was Jacobite, 'Though Geordie Reigns in Jamie's Stead', which was collected in *Scotish [sic] Songs* (1794) edited by Joseph Ritson (1752-1803). Ritson was himself 'Jacobite turned Jacobin' and deeply involved in debates about national identity as well as interested in contemporary politics where, like Burns, he was one of the drivers in

---

<sup>28</sup> *Robert Burns: The Critical Heritage* edited by Donald A. Low (London and Boston: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1974), p.249.

<sup>29</sup> *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* Vol II, p.708.

<sup>30</sup> *The Letters of Robert Burns: Volume II, 1790-1796* edited by J. De Lancey Ferguson; 2<sup>nd</sup> edition by G. Ross Roy (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985), Robert Lomas, *Freemasonry and the Birth of Modern Science* (Gloucester, Massachusetts: Fair Winds Press, 2003), p.288.

the age of discussions of Celticism.<sup>31</sup> The 'honest man' was also 'a leitmotif of Jacobite expression', while the trope of 'brotherhood' in the text could be ascribed to Burns's keen Freemasonry (though it might also be said that part of the attraction of the person of Charles Edward Stuart for Burns may well have been the Pretender's reputed status as 'Grand Master of the Masonic Royal Order of Scotland'). As a result of this position a line of communication is alleged to have existed between the Pretender and another prominent Mason much admired by Burns, George Washington.<sup>32</sup> However much substance ought to be given to Charles Edward's Freemasonry, and however lurid the Freemasonic lore might be, these legends have persisted from Burns's own times down to the present day. What we see in the text of 'Is there for Honest Poverty' is at least two alibis should anyone question our Crown-sworn exciseman about the democratic overtones of his text. He could respond by claiming either the centrality of Jacobitism or of Masonry to the song rather than active, contemporary reformist sensibilities.

Burns wrote, collected and 'improved' a significant number of Jacobite or Jacobite-inflected songs, that would become staples of the Scottish folk-canon down to the present day, for the series of anthologies, *The Scots Musical Museum* edited by James Johnson (?1753-1811) from 1786 until 1803 (Burns material appearing posthumously in the later volumes). Here appeared 'Auld Lang Syne', 'Scots Wha Hae', 'Awa Whigs Awa' (1789), which Ritson reprinted in his *Scotish Songs*, 'The Battle of Sherramuir' (1790), 'Ye Jacobites by Name' (1792), 'Charlie he's My Darling' (1796), 'It was a' for our Rightfu' King' (1796) and

---

<sup>31</sup> Joseph Ritson (ed.), *Scotish Songs Volume II* (London: J. Johnson, 1794), pp.441-3.; See Colin Kidd, *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-c.1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p.253 [see pp.253-7].

<sup>32</sup> Murray Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p.216; see p.274.

‘The German Lairdie’ (1796).<sup>33</sup> Burns and Johnson, a native of the Scottish Borders who was an engraver and sold music in Edinburgh, were generally inspired (as Ritson was too) by *Ancient and Modern Scottish Songs, Heroic Ballads* (1776) edited by David Herd (1732-1810); a text which also had a profound impact on Walter Scott, when he edited his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1802-3). What we see, clearly, is the progress of a song-collecting movement for Scotland, in which Jacobitism was undeniably a key theme, but that should be seen primarily as an important part of the growing historical and lyrical sentimental predisposition of the emergent romantic movement.

Carolina Oliphant (Lady Nairne) (1766-1845), the descendant of a Perthshire Jacobite family, was inspired by Burns’ endeavours in the *Scots Musical Museum* to become a significant Jacobite song-writer herself from the 1780s, though many of her songs made their impact through a slow publication process well into the nineteenth century and long after her death. Like Burns, however, her oeuvre of Jacobite material has become an important component of the Scottish folk movement of the late twentieth and early twenty first century.<sup>34</sup> However, the most cogent project in Jacobite song following the work of Burns is that of James Hogg, another Presbyterian, whose main motivation may simply have been the fee which he commanded when the Highland Society of London commissioned from him, *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland* (1819 and 1821).<sup>35</sup> As William Donaldson notes, the prowess of Scottish and Highland units opposing Napoleon had effected a major change,

---

<sup>33</sup> See Donald Low (ed.), *The Scots Musical Museum, 1787-1803* (Aldershot: Scolar Press, 1991); *The Scots Musical Museum* has been thoroughly re-edited by Murray Pittock for the *Oxford Press Edition of the Works of Robert Burns* which will be published in 2017.

<sup>34</sup> See Carol McGuirk, ‘Jacobite History to National Song: Robert Burns and Carolina Oliphant’ in *The Eighteenth Century* Vol. 47, No. 2/3, ‘Ballads and Songs in the Eighteenth Century’ (Summer/Fall 2006), pp. 253-287.

<sup>35</sup> James Hogg, *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland* 2 vols edited by Murray G.H. Pittock (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002 & 2003); see Volume I, ‘Introduction’, p.xx.

unimaginable only a few years before: 'By the summer of 1815, real Highland Laddies [as opposed to those hymned in song] stood higher in public regard than at any time before, or possibly since.'<sup>36</sup> The Highland Society had been formed in 1778 and soon became a force to reckon with in British public life. It was the main agitator behind the repeal in 1782 of the Disarming Act, which had prohibited the wearing of the plaid after the final Jacobite rebellion. In 1786 it encouraged the organisation which would lead to the British Fisheries Society as an important player in the economic administration of Scotland and other parts of the United Kingdom. The most visible result of this initiative was the setting up of fishing villages in the north of Scotland, eventually mopping up some of the displaced people from the Clearances. Through the nineteenth and into the twentieth centuries it was often concerned with promoting Highland and Scottish units in the British army.<sup>37</sup> William Donaldson has noted various, broadly positive components in Hogg's Unionist-primed *Relics*, including the reversal of the idea of the Gàidhealtachd as a place of want; the oblique echoing of the loss of people and culture being engineered in the early stages of the Clearances; and - typical of Hogg's oeuvre more widely - scatological and sexual fun, notably in the mocking of the Elector of Hanover, a tradition, which predated Hogg's work in contemporary Jacobite expression.<sup>38</sup> Hogg, like Burns and Oliphant, is also in Donaldson's view 'a great songwriter', who helps propel creative Jacobite expression as a lively 'mythogenic force' through succeeding Scottish literature, song and culture.<sup>39</sup> Hogg introduced his *Relics* with a large claim: 'It has always been admitted, that our Jacobite

---

<sup>36</sup> William Donaldson, *The Jacobite Song* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1988) p.92; this book remains a crucial introduction to the topic of Jacobite Song.

<sup>37</sup> See Katie Louise McCulloch, *Building the Highland Empire: The Highland society of London and the Formation of Charitable Networks in Great Britain and Canada, 1778-1857* (Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Guelph, 2014).

<sup>38</sup> Donaldson, *Jacobite Song*, pp.90-108.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, pp.108-9.

songs and tunes are the best that the country ever produced.’<sup>40</sup> This is why, he claims, there is a need for his anthology, effectively the first entirely Jacobite anthology to appear. He is, however, also quick to insert a Whiggish counter-narrative about these pieces:

They actually form a delightful though rude epitome of the history of our country during a period highly eventful, when every internal movement was decisive toward the establishment of the rights and liberties which we have since enjoyed; and they likewise furnish us with a key to the annals of many ancient and noble families, who were either involved in ruin by the share they had in those commotions, or rose on that ruin in consequence of the support they afforded to the side that prevailed.<sup>41</sup>

Hogg’s anthology was an important document ‘in serving the contemporary purpose in the rehabilitation of Scotland as loyal’.<sup>42</sup> This was a cause that was embraced furth of Scotland, for instance in the work of the composer Charles Dibdin (1745-1814), an arch-British patriot of the period of the Napoleonic Wars. He produced a song, ‘There never was a Scot who was true to his clan’, which in the most execrable Scots diction explicitly celebrates Ossian, who is granted an unproblematic historical location, then Robert the Bruce and finally the Scottish troops in their successes against Bonaparte.<sup>43</sup> It might also be mentioned that Dibdin’s patriotic naval song, ‘Tom Bowling’, featured frequently over the years at the Last Night at the Proms, was based on a character from Smollett’s novel, *Roderick Random* (1748) and is therefore yet another aspect of the Scottish-engineered British military patriotism of Britain’s wars with France between the 1740s and 1815.

---

<sup>40</sup> *Relics* (1819), Hogg’s ‘Introduction’, p.vii.

<sup>41</sup> *Relics* (1819), Hogg’s ‘Introduction’, pp.vii-viii.

<sup>42</sup> Pittock (ed.), *Jacobite Relics* (2002), ‘Introduction’, p.xvi.

<sup>43</sup> *The Songs of Charles Dibdin* Volume I (London: E. Lloyd, 1847), p.310.

The fidelity of the Jacobite clans and their martial prowess - now repackaged as loyalty to the Hanoverians – allowed Whiggish Britons to become consumers of Jacobite culture. Something good could be strained from the failed rebellions, and this is how Walter Scott's *Waverley* (1814), a text that also played a large part in paving the way for Hogg's *Jacobite Relics* project, is often read. We see evidence for this effect in the testimony of one contemporary reader of *Waverley*, Maria Edgeworth (1768-1849), where Charles Edward Stuart is now safely to be enjoyed; in a letter to James Ballantyne (1772-1833), Scott's printer and literary agent, she writes:

The *Pre-* [sic] the Chevalier is beautifully drawn—

'A prince: aye, every inch a prince!'

His polished manners, his exquisite address, politeness and generosity, interest the reader irresistibly, and he pleases the more from the contrast between him and those who surround him. I think he is my favorite character.<sup>44</sup>

Edgeworth's mock-coyness, resisting the word 'Pretender' (a word somewhere between simply claimant, in its original definition, and by now carrying also the connotation of 'spurious') would seem to be in deference to Ballantyne's nationality. Edgeworth is elaborately signalling that she does not wish to offend a Scot by referring to a failed compatriot claimant in negative terms. Edgeworth here, then, acknowledges Charles Edward's cultural efficacy in having now become an inclusive 'Scottish' character or symbol when in fact perhaps as many if not more Scots had stood *against* the Jacobites in 1745. The

---

<sup>44</sup> John O Hayden (ed), *Scott: The Critical Heritage* (London: Routledge, 1970), p.76.

use of the word 'Chevalier' here is also a more neutral choice (popularly coined by Burns in his song 'Charlie is My Darling'), connoting knighthood and chivalry, generally, while leaving no precise sense of royalty. Charles Edward Stuart had become a pleasant delicacy for consumption more widely in the British Isles.

If Scott certainly helps rehabilitate Jacobitism for a wide British audience, does he deserve to have laid against him a wider set of charges: that he is responsible for the 'tartanization' and 'Highlandism' that supposedly ensue in the nineteenth-century? Furthermore, Scott's Tory politics tend to be aligned with his purportedly phoney aesthetic offerings, and he is charged with tenderising the Jacobites and other parts of Scottish history in order to make them easily palatable for English digestion within the Union. Scott's reputation continues to suffer in today's nationalist and Left-leaning Scotland, even as outside Scotland the study of Scott is enjoying a renaissance with an international array of scholars appreciating his work from a wide variety of critical approaches and acknowledging his crucial role in the development of western literature. Edwin Muir's *Scott and Scotland: The Predicament of the Scottish Writer* (1936), one of the most eloquent works of twentieth-century criticism, influentially diagnosed Scott as suffering from a 'curious emptiness behind [...] the wealth of his imagination', and as peddler of irresponsible romance disconnected from, indeed in denial of, the reality of modern Scotland.<sup>45</sup> Alternatively, in his *The Historical Novel* (1937) - published only a year later though without much English-language impact until its translation the 1960s - Georg Lukács (1885-1971) praised Scott for his realism and for his brilliant grasp of context, so that his work reflects:

---

<sup>45</sup> Edwin Muir, *Scott and Scotland: The Predicament of the Scottish Writer* (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1982), p.2.

The organic character of English development [which] is a resultant made up of the components of ceaseless class struggles, and their bloody resolution in great or small, successful or abortive uprisings. The enormous political and social transformations awoke in England, too, the feeling for history, the awareness of historical development.<sup>46</sup>

For Lukács, then, Scott in his 'English' - or rather British - context is deeply authentic in demonstrating 'development' or the 'progress' of modern Britain, as exemplary in many ways of the modern European bourgeois state. Alongside Scott's apprehension of the modern, though, is an acknowledgement of the way in which parts of the people, classes and cultures, are marginalized or crushed though often never with complete 'resolution' in the process (in spite of what 'organic' narratives might attest, most obviously the progressive Whig narrative of British history).

In keeping with the apprehensions of Lukács, we might suggest that *Waverley* features an uneasy dialogue between the hard-bitten facts of human history and romantic narrative, the latter generated by characters in the novel, we might say, rather than by Scott himself. Early on the narrator says: 'I beg pardon, once and for all, of those readers who take up novels merely for amusement, for plaguing them so long with old-fashioned politics, and Whig and Tory, and Hanoverians and Jacobites.'<sup>47</sup> Here again, are the Scots-British politics, cultural and constitutional, that Robert Burns and others earlier also had to pick their way through. These 'old-fashioned politics', are what have shaped Scotland and Britain more widely, but they are not to become site of a 'romantic' novel where the past, seemingly, is done and dusted. As Scott is well aware things are not so simple:

---

<sup>46</sup> Georg Lukács, *The Historical Novel* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1963), p.32.

<sup>47</sup> Walter Scott, *Waverley* edited by P.D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), p.26.



This race [the Jacobites] has now almost entirely disappeared from the land, and with it, doubtless, much absurd political prejudice; but also, many living examples of singular and disinterested attachment to the principles of loyalty which they received from their fathers, and of old Scottish faith, hospitality, worth and honour.<sup>48</sup>

*Waverley* is precisely about reading the past properly. This past is *not* so easy to read, either because of our modern superiority or because of our equally lazy consumption of it, as something exotic, as 'othered'. If we are aware, history contains both noble and brutal human lessons and, if unaware, potentially *misleading* romance that can seem all too deceptively cogent. This is why the fictional mode, rather than 'straight' history, is entirely apposite to Scott's intellectual and aesthetic purposes. The central character of the novel, Edward Waverley, is our mostly confused - wavering - avatar through the action. An officer in the Hanoverian army, he becomes a rebel, largely through the insidious plotting of the Jacobites. However, the son of a government loyalist he is also nephew of Sir Everard, a Tory and a Jacobite and as well as being part of an English family, as divided as much as any Scottish equivalent; Edward is, then, part of a problematic British nation. Scott's Unionist purposes are seen again when his narrator says of Edward's upbringing: 'I know not whether the boy's nurse had been a Welch-woman or a Scotch-woman, or in what manner he associated a shield emblazoned with three ermines'.<sup>49</sup> Here, we have a reminder that Celtic sensibilities are potentially all around Edward, our British 'everyman', and not least since 1603 when the kingship of the British Isles (the three ermines of England, Ireland and Scotland) was united. British history is suffused with complexities that are not easily

---

<sup>48</sup> *Waverley*, p.363.

<sup>49</sup> *Waverley*, p.11.

disentangled into singular – rather than hyphenated - ‘national’ identities. Such hyphenation may be the result of programmatic action, 1603, 1707 etc. but it is also the necessary consequence of the cultural consanguinity that preceded these constitutional moments. This, for Scott, is the British reality, more so than anything merely constitutional. For Scott too, it is not ‘simply’ progress towards British modernity that preoccupies him in *Waverley*, but also the disruptions of the Union of 1603 Union brought about from the mid-seventeenth century onwards by the intensified disputes of Kirk and kingdom that have in the early nineteenth century receded, though - as the heated response to *Old Mortality* demonstrated – not entirely. The disruption of British unity is noted yet again in Edward’s formative years as is he is tutored by his uncle’s chaplain, ‘an Oxonian, who had lost his fellowship for declining to take the oath at the accession of George I’.<sup>50</sup> This tutor, Mr Pembroke, attempts to have his book published, *A Dissent from Dissenters, or the Comprehension Confuted; shewing the impossibility of any composition between the Church and Puritans, Presbyterians, or Sectaries of any description, illustrated from the Scriptures, the Fathers of the Church, and the soundest controversial Divines*.<sup>51</sup> To the early nineteenth-century readership these disputes over the religious word might seem arcane and antiquarian, bound up in a seventeenth-century mentality, but in one way or another they rumble on beyond Scott’s time. Still to play out in the future, were the Disruption of the Church of Scotland in 1843 and the Anglo-Catholic Oxford movement which emerged in England the year after Scott’s death. These things illustrate, obviously enough, that the issue of religious authority, indeed, the settled constitution of British secular government, remained an issue of enduring importance beyond Scott’s own time. *Waverley* is a novel about divided Britain as much as about divided Scotland, where underneath both states

---

<sup>50</sup> *Waverley* p.13.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 31.

historical fault-lines remained, and not far below the surface. It may have been 'sixty years since', but recent political perturbations such as Jacobin republicanism threatened the very existence of King and Kirk of any kind in Britain. Scott was not attempting to sugar-coat the past or the present, or render magnificent a savage past, now having given way to rather boring, settled present. Katie Trumpener wisely sees Scott working in a context where he is aware of a largely unceasing, unsettled dialectic of 'political incorporation and disenfranchisement'.<sup>52</sup> Scott knows that there is no end of history, but rather repeated patterns of disunity, notwithstanding a striving for unity. That for him is the essential problem which he as a unionist confronted.

A crucial part of the cultural underfelt in *Waverley* is song generally, exemplifying how Scottish song, and Highland song, particularly, had become such strong British mood music since the 1780s. Scott knows that like other forms of romantic expansiveness, it can deceive. In the famous 'seduction' scene of *Waverley*, the Jacobite Flora Mac-Ivor sings:

But the dark hours of night and of slumber are past,  
The morn on our mountains is dawning at last;  
Glenadale's peaks are illumin'd with the rays,  
And the streams of Glenfinnan leap bright in the blaze.

O high-minded Moray!—the exiled—the dear!—  
In the blush of the dawning the Standard uprear!  
Wide, wide on the winds of the north let it fly,

---

<sup>52</sup> Katie Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), p.19.

Like the sun's latest flash when the tempest is nigh! (p.115)

Replete with Jacobite symbolism, of the rising sun, and hinting that the rising is already underway, or about to be, hard facts are lost on Edward. A grey-hound interrupts proceedings much to Waverley's annoyance, enraptured as he is with Flora, her song and its romantic words. Waverley is now in his 'tartan fever' dissociated from the actuality of events that are unfolding and oblivious of the fact that the canny highlanders are playing him, with-holding letters from his commanding officer summoning him to his garrison during his long sojourn in the Highlands so that he believes he has been treated dishonorably by the army when eventually outlawed.<sup>53</sup> Of course, Scott is not dismissing romance altogether, understanding its attractions as he certainly did only too well. In the final chapter proper of the novel, Edward now extricated from his entanglements, considers a portrait in the wild highland landscape of the executed Jacobite warrior, Fergus Mac-Ivor, Flora's brother - and, in the novel, one of Charles Edward's right-hand men. Waverley himself also appears in the painting, and regards it, 'the ardent, fiery and impetuous character' of Fergus, 'finely contrasted with the contemplative, fanciful and enthusiastic expression' of himself.<sup>54</sup> The romance that was never really in Fergus, but in Edward, is now dissipated potentially for the consumption of the observer of the canvas, who if wary, will see as Edward now does that it is only part of the story. Indeed, the romanticizing of events is attractive and even inevitable, but it is only one way of patterning and consuming history. Romance and reality (including human motivations that can be as noble or nefarious as romance) are confusing, potentially dis-unifying currencies that are each equally omnipresent in human culture. Like Burns, Scott is an artist of promiscuous sympathy, not least in

---

<sup>53</sup> *Waverley*, p.362.

<sup>54</sup> *Waverley*, p.361.

*Waverley*, which ending with the uncertainties of the painting just alluded to, is metonymic of this text itself. It is also the Scottish text that more than any other says the 'Jacobite' problem, in its long historical complexities, is a British rather than only a Scottish problem. Ironically enough, much like the career of Presbyterian Jacobite Burns, Scott's *Waverley* is a great formative, indeed, unifying moment in Scottish literature, but conjured out of the wider conditions of British history. The historical novel, along with Jacobite song, is the invention of Scottish literature and dissatisfying as these things might be to hopelessly, idealistic culturally nationalist versions of Scottish literature, real Scottish and British literature they are, responsive to - rather than evasive of - complex contexts.

Scott's *Waverley* is written at a time when rebellion or revolution on British soil remained entirely imaginable, but for the many novelists who have followed Scott over the succeeding two hundred years this is perhaps much less the case and the charge of escapist romance might well stick. However, it is interesting to observe Christian Isobel Johnstone (1781-1857), who finds an historically well-observed and even gritty path, partly post-*Waverley*, in a tale of highland pride and chivalry. Her *Clan-Albin: A National Tale* (1815) features a highlander fighting in the British army in Ireland and Spain from the 1780s onwards. All kinds of cultural dislocation and disunity are diagnosed and, its feminist author has a particularly good eye for strong female characters at the centre of cultures and communities and also their scepticism both about war and the rapaciousness of commerce. The inheritor of Scott's mantle as a historical novelist in Scotland, Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-94) published *Kidnapped*, often seen as a 'children's book' (indeed it was first published in the *Young Folks* magazine in 1886), but, featuring child-murder and the enslavement of minors, it has rather more serious undertones than is usually realized. Neil

Munro (1863-1930) published *Doom Castle* (1901), D.K. Broster (1877-1950) *The Flight of the Heron* (1925), Georgette Heyer (1902-74) *The Masqueraders* (1928), John Prebble (1915-2001), *Glencoe* (1966), Janet Paisley (b.1948) *White Rose Rebel* (2007), all Jacobite-related and only a selection from a long line of post-Jacobite novels with Scottish settings. The highly successful *Outlander* television series (2014 onwards) based on the novels of Diana J. Gabaldon (b.1952) continues to demonstrate the appeal of Highland Jacobite romance patented by Scott. The genre exerts an attraction well beyond Scotland, given the American popularity of *Outlander*. We should also note here the fact that Broster, Heyer and Prebble, were all born in England and have enjoyed a large international readership. In some sense all of these texts play with the possibility of honorable rebellion or disunity, a suppressed topic in the critical literature but one as central as nationhood or imagined communities.

Nor should we overlook the Scott-inspired unionist, cultural nationalism of William Edmondstone Aytoun (1813-65), a pronounced Tory. Aytoun became involved in the National Association for the Vindication of Scottish Rights (established in 1853), an organization that partook of Aytoun's mentality, whereby Scotland was emphatically a nation in its own right, albeit in union with others in the British Isles.<sup>55</sup> Aytoun's collection *Lays of the Scottish Cavaliers* (1849) stitches together a national cultural canon that includes Robert the Bruce, the Battle of Flodden, the Duke of Montrose, Dundee (or Claverhouse), the Glencoe massacre and Charles Edward Stuart. Here we have a distinctive Scottish pantheon, all congregated around Stuart allegiance. *Lays of the Scottish Cavaliers* was a hugely popular collection in Aytoun's lifetime, going through five editions and also appearing in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*. The use of the term 'cavaliers' carried

---

<sup>55</sup> Graham Morton, *Unionist Nationalism* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 1999), p.146.

connotations of the British Civil War - a very deliberate flying in the face of the overarching stereotype of Scotland as 'Whiggish' - and was also somewhat Frenchified; Aytoun's characters were in many ways read backwards through the lens of Charles Edward Stuart. Montrose is introduced as '[a]mong the devoted champions who, during the wildest and most stormy period of our history, maintained the cause of Church and king', even though Montrose's career was much more chequered than that.<sup>56</sup> Here are romances lavishly annotated with historical notes and in their rather lachrymose tones they are not so different from what was happening to the treatment of iconic national figures, elsewhere at this time in England, France, Germany and other nations. The point is aesthetic fashion, rather than (as over-read in some forms of culturally nationalist criticism) vapidness of national consciousness unique to Scotland. And what are we to make of a much later text that makes use of the Jacobite symbol of the white rose by Christopher Murray Grieve (Hugh MacDiarmid) [1892-1978] in his poem, 'The Little White Rose' (1934)?

The rose of all the world is not for me.

I want for my part

Only the little white rose of Scotland

That smells sharp and sweet—and breaks the heart.<sup>57</sup>

How should we interpret this Jacobite nationalist romance from the hard-headed, republican communist MacDiarmid who had, of course, very little time for either the politics or for the creativity of Walter Scott? The white rose was worn by Scottish National party members at the

---

<sup>56</sup> *Poems of William Edmondstoune Aytoun* (London: H. Milford and Oxford University Press, 1921), p.15; see also Catriona M.M. Macdonald, 'Montrose and Modern Memory: The Literary Afterlife of the First Marquis of Montrose' in *Scottish Literary Review* 6:1 (2014), pp.1-18.

<sup>57</sup> *MacDiarmid: Selected Poems* edited by Alan Riach and Michael Grieve (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1999), p.198.

opening of the Scottish parliament and again at their biggest Westminster showing of 56 MPs during the Queen's speech to parliament in 2015. By the same token, and with a similar degree of irony, the rhetoric and symbols of Whig-Presbyterian Scotland have been adopted for nationalist ends.<sup>58</sup> The Whiggish language of 'covenant' has had an afterlife through the work of John MacCormick (1904-1961), founder in 1951 of the Scottish Covenant Association for an independent Scottish parliament. It was invoked repeatedly and explicitly as the covenanted right of the Scottish people again in the years immediately preceding the establishment of the devolved Scottish parliament at Holyrood (which came to pass in 1999). Politicians and writers alike have over the last two centuries or so put the partisan legacies of both Jacobitism and Whiggery to incongruous uses, to versions indeed of what might be called Jacobite unionism and Whig-Presbyterian nationalism. The curious history of modern Scottish literature is in large measure the story of how the defining century of religious and partisan strife between 1637 and 1746 was refurbished to meet later - and very different - ideological needs.

---

<sup>58</sup> Jonathan Hearn, *Claiming Scotland: national identity and liberal culture* (Edinburgh: Polygon, 2000).